

DISMISSAL FROM EMPLOYMENT AND THE REMEDIES

Second Edition

DR ASHGAR ALI ALI MOHAMED

LL.B (Hons), MCL (IIUM)

LL.M (Hons) (University of Auckland, New Zealand),

Ph.D (Business Law)

Non-practising Advocate & Solicitor
of the High Court of Malaya



MEMBERS OF THE LEXISNEXIS GROUP WORLDWIDE

| | |
|----------------|---|
| Malaysia | LexisNexis Malaysia Sdn Bhd† (formerly known as Malayan Law Journal Sdn Bhd) T1-6, Jaya 33, 3 Jalan Semangat Seksyen 13, 46200 Petaling Jaya Selangor Darul Ehsan, MALAYSIA |
| Australia | LexisNexis Butterworths, Chatswood, NEW SOUTH WALES |
| Austria | LexisNexis Verlag ARD Orac GmbH & Co KG, VIENNA |
| Benelux | LexisNexis Benelux, AMSTERDAM |
| Canada | LexisNexis Canada, Markham, ONTARIO |
| China | LexisNexis China, BEIJING |
| France | LexisNexis SA, PARIS |
| Germany | LexisNexis Deutschland GmbH, MUNSTER |
| Hong Kong | LexisNexis Hong Kong, HONG KONG |
| India | LexisNexis Butterworths Wadhwa Nagpur, Gurgaon, HARYANA |
| Italy | Giuffrè Editore, MILAN |
| Japan | LexisNexis Japan, TOKYO |
| New Zealand | LexisNexis NZ Ltd, WELLINGTON |
| Poland | Wydawnictwo Prawnicze LexisNexis Sp, WARSAW |
| Singapore | LexisNexis Singapore, SINGAPORE |
| South Africa | LexisNexis Butterworths, DURBAN |
| United Kingdom | LexisNexis Butterworths Tolley, LONDON and EDINBURGH |
| USA | LexisNexis Dayton, OHIO |

© LexisNexis, a division of Reed Elsevier (Singapore) 2008 Pte Ltd
2014

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, including photocopying and recording, without the written permission of the copyright holder, application for which should be addressed to the publisher. Such written permission must also be obtained before any part of this publication is stored in a retrieval system of any nature.

The publisher, authors, contributors and endorsers of this publication each excludes liability for loss suffered by any person resulting in any way from the use of, or reliance on this publication.

ISBN 978-967-400-241-1 (hc)
978-967-400-234-3 (hc)

Printed in Malaysia by TBA

Managing Director, Southeast Asia

Ella Wang,
BA (Journalism), MS (Integrated Marketing Communication)
(Northwestern University)

Associate Director, Product Development, Southeast Asia

Norainni A Rahman, LLB (Hons)
Advocate and Solicitor, Supreme Court of Singapore

Associate Director, Publishing, Southeast Asia

Annette Rosemarie John, LLB (Hons) (Lond), CLP
Non-practising Advocate and Solicitor, High Court of Malaya

Managing Editor, Malaysia

Annie Yeoh Leng Leng, LLB (Hons) (Lond)

Legal Editors

Sivaguru Paramasivam, LLB (Lond)
Jasmine Halili, LLB (Hons), LLM (Aust)
Trisha Gomez, LLB (Hons) (Lond)
Archana Patrick, LLB (Hons) (Lond), CLP
Non-practising Advocate and Solicitor, High Court of Malaya

Manager, Editorial Operations, Southeast Asia

Preghaladhan Vizia Balakrishnan
Diploma in Business Administration (ABE-UK)

Team Leader, Editorial Operations

Karina Koh May Wah

Published in Malaysia by

LexisNexis Malaysia Sdn Bhd
(formerly known as Malayan Law Journal Sdn Bhd)

Table of Contents

| | |
|---------------------------------------|-------|
| Foreword to the Second Edition | v |
| Foreword to the First Edition | vii |
| Acknowledgement..... | ix |
| Preface to the Second Edition | xi |
| Preface to the First Edition | xiii |
| Table of Cases | xxix |
| Table of Legislation | ci |
| Table of Subsidiary Legislation | cix |
| Table of Foreign Legislation | cxiii |

Chapter 1

Types and Categories of Employment

| | |
|--|----|
| Introduction | 1 |
| Employees of the public sector | 1 |
| Employees in the private sector | 5 |
| Types of employment..... | 6 |
| Regular contract of employment..... | 7 |
| Permanent employment | 7 |
| Probationary employee | 10 |
| Apprenticeship | 14 |
| Fixed term or temporary contract | 16 |
| Fixed term contract..... | 16 |
| Part-time employment | 22 |
| Casual workers..... | 25 |
| Others | 26 |
| Voluntary workers | 26 |
| Work sharing..... | 27 |
| Home workers | 29 |
| Migrant workers | 30 |
| Domestic servants..... | 32 |

Chapter 2

Labour Statutes in Malaysia and the Employment

Relationship

| | |
|--------------------------------------|----|
| Employment statutes in Malaysia..... | 35 |
| Employment Act 1955 | 36 |

| | |
|--|----|
| Employment (Termination and Lay-Off Benefits) | |
| Regulations 1980..... | 40 |
| Employees Provident Fund Act 1991 | 43 |
| Employees' Social Security Act 1969..... | 44 |
| Workmen's Compensation (Foreign Worker's Compensation Scheme) (Insurance) Order 2005 | 47 |
| Industrial Relations Act 1967 | 48 |
| Trade Unions Act 1959..... | 50 |
| Occupational Safety And Health Act 1994..... | 52 |
| Factories And Machinery Act 1967 | 53 |
| Workmen's Compensation Act 1952 | 54 |
| 'Contract of Service' or 'Contract for Service': Interpretation of 'Employee' | 65 |
| 'Contract of Service' or 'Contract for Service': Judicial interpretation..... | 67 |
| Conclusion | 74 |

Chapter 3

Security of Tenure in Employment

| | |
|--|----|
| Introduction | 77 |
| Loss of employment: Its effect on workers..... | 79 |
| 'Property right' in employment..... | 82 |
| 'Right to livelihood' in the Federal Constitution | 85 |
| Employer's prerogative to make commercial decisions..... | 88 |
| Conclusion | 93 |

Chapter 4

Security of Tenure in Employment: The Historical Development

| | |
|--|-----|
| Introduction | 95 |
| Evolution of worker's status and security of tenure | 96 |
| In England | 96 |
| Forced labour | 97 |
| Combination of workers: Promoting worker's status in employment..... | 100 |
| Forced labour abolished | 102 |
| Change in the terminology from 'master' and 'servant' to 'employer' and 'employee' | 103 |
| Doctrine of <i>laissez-faire</i> in employment relationship..... | 104 |
| Development of 'General Hiring' theory | 106 |
| The 'at-will' employment doctrine of the United States..... | 108 |
| Discharge on good faith doctrine | 112 |
| Discharge in violation of public policy..... | 112 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| Status of workers during British administrative authority in the Malay Peninsular | 114 |
| Migration of foreign labourers into the Malay Peninsular | 114 |
| Workers status during British administration of the Malay peninsular | 116 |
| International Labour Organisation (ILO): Promoting and protecting worker's status and security of tenure in employment | 120 |
| An overview of the International Labour Organisation | 120 |
| ILO Recommendation No 119 of 1963 | 122 |
| ILO Convention No 158 of 1982 | 123 |
| ILO Recommendation No 166 of 1982 | 128 |
| The application of the ILO's guidelines in Malaysia | 133 |
| Conclusion | 134 |

Chapter 5

Common Law Wrongful Dismissal and Statutory Unfair Dismissal

| | |
|--|-----|
| Introduction | 137 |
| Security of tenure: common law approach | 137 |
| Notice of termination of the contract of employment: Binding effect | 138 |
| Reasonable notice of termination | 141 |
| Termination of contract of employment: Reasonable notice in England | 145 |
| Termination of contract of employment: Reasonable notice in Canada | 146 |
| Termination of contract of employment: Reasonable notice in Australia | 147 |
| Termination of contract of employment: Reasonable notice in New Zealand | 148 |
| Termination of contract of employment: Reasonable notice in Malaysia | 148 |
| Waiver of notice of termination: The circumstances | |
| Specific performance of a contract of employment | 150 |
| Mitigation of loss | 154 |
| Statutory unfair or unjustifiable dismissal | 157 |
| Substantive justification | 158 |
| Procedural justification | 158 |
| Application in Selected Countries | 159 |
| Remedies for unfair or unjustifiable dismissal | 162 |
| Reinstatement or Re-engagement | 163 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| Monetary compensation | 164 |
| Mitigation of Loss | 166 |
| Redundancy compensation | 166 |
| Wrongful dismissal and unfair or unjustifiable dismissal: | |
| The comparison..... | 170 |
| Conclusion | 174 |

Chapter 6

Direct Dismissal and Constructive Dismissal

| | |
|---|-----|
| Introduction | 177 |
| Direct dismissal | 178 |
| Constructive dismissal..... | 181 |
| Constructive dismissal: Definition | 182 |
| Constructive dismissal: The Development | 185 |
| Employment relationship: Mutual trust and confidence..... | 186 |
| Conduct infringing the implied trust and confidence | 190 |

Chapter 7

Constructive Dismissal: A Review of Decided Cases

| | |
|---|-----|
| Constructive dismissal..... | 197 |
| Industrial Court award in constructive dismissal claims | 199 |
| Conclusion | 215 |

Chapter 8

Selected Grounds for Dismissal

| | |
|--|-----|
| Grounds of dismissal | 217 |
| Misconduct..... | 219 |
| Insubordination | 221 |
| Superior orders with reference to <i>Ngeow Voon Yean's</i> case..... | 224 |
| Absenteeism | 236 |
| Drug abuse in the workplace | 241 |
| Drug abuse: A gross misconduct | 243 |
| Theft of employer's property | 246 |
| Dishonesty | 249 |
| Sexual harassment | 252 |
| Forms of sexual harassment | 253 |
| Sexual harassment: A violation of individual rights | 256 |
| Sexual harassment in the Penal Code | 257 |
| Sexual Harassment in the Workplace..... | 258 |
| Duty to provide safe and conducive working environment..... | 264 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| Evidence to substantiate allegations of sexual harassment | 266 |
| Sexual harassment case summary | 270 |
| Poor work performance | 274 |
| Internet abuse at the workplace | 278 |
| Conflict of interest | 280 |
| Caused company grave embarrassment | 284 |
| Violence, abuse, assault or threats | 287 |
| Habitually coming late and/or leaving work early without permission..... | 288 |
| Doctrine of proportionality of punishment | 288 |

Chapter 9

Dismissal Under the Guise of Retrenchment

| | |
|--|-----|
| Introduction | 297 |
| The law on retrenchment in Malaysia | 299 |
| Terminologies | 300 |
| Lay-off | 300 |
| Retrenchment | 301 |
| Redundancy | 302 |
| Redundancy to retrenchment: The circumstances | 303 |
| The business disappears – the company is shutting down the business entirely | 305 |
| The place of work disappears – the employer is shutting down the business in the place where the employee works | 306 |
| Where the mobility clause is expressly clear and unambiguous..... | 307 |
| Harshness of the mobility clause | 308 |
| Implied terms of transfer | 308 |
| The job disappears – the company eliminates the work the employee does, either generally or in a particular workplace..... | 313 |
| Fewer people are required to do the work – the number of people doing that job is to be reduced but not eliminated | 315 |
| Retrenchment: Questions considered by Industrial Court | 317 |
| Redundancy situation leading to retrenchment..... | 317 |
| Consequent retrenchment must comply with accepted standards of procedure | 318 |
| Outsourcing to victimise employee | 322 |
| Voluntary Separation Scheme being forced or coerced on employee | 323 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| The test of redundancy | 324 |
| Proof of redundancy | 326 |
| Accepting retrenchment benefits: Whether allowed to allege dismissal without just cause or excuse | 328 |
| Illustrations from decided cases | 330 |
| <i>Scott Wilson (Malaysia) Sdn Bhd v</i> <i>Parameswari Perumal</i> | 330 |
| <i>Fabulous Strength Sdn Bhd v Razali Zahidin & Anor</i> | 332 |
| <i>Chan Seng Wah v Securicor (M) Sdn Bhd / Safeguards</i> <i>Securicor Sdn Bhd</i> | 333 |
| <i>Lim Siok Yean v Pengkalen Securities Sdn Bhd</i> | 335 |
| <i>Dynamic Management Sdn Bhd v Yang Poh Lam</i> | 336 |
| <i>Maycorp (M) Sdn Bhd v Sim Hong Siang</i> | 338 |
| <i>Limton Parts Manufacturer Sdn Bhd v Chandramalar</i> <i>Nagarajah</i> | 339 |
| Conclusion | 341 |

Chapter 10

Domestic Inquiry and Disciplinary Punishments

| | |
|--|-----|
| Introduction | 343 |
| Complaints | 346 |
| Notice to show cause | 346 |
| Suspension pending investigation | 349 |
| Period of suspension | 354 |
| Suspension with or without salary | 355 |
| Investigation | 358 |
| Domestic hearing | 362 |
| Notice of hearing | 365 |
| Charge | 366 |
| Hearing | 369 |
| Decision of the Inquiry Panel | 370 |
| Notes of proceedings | 371 |
| Appeal | 373 |
| A Review of <i>Siti Sarinah bt Sibun v Azizah bt</i> <i>Kamaruddin and Anor</i> | 373 |
| Conclusion | 377 |

Chapter 11

Dismissal without just Cause or Excuse: The Adjudication Process

| | |
|--|-----|
| Introduction | 379 |
| Industrial Court: The adjudication process | 380 |
| Industrial Court: An overview | 380 |

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|---|-----|
| composition of the Industrial Court..... | 383 |
| Types of cases heard in the Industrial Court | 385 |
| Industrial Court: A court of equity and good conscience promoting social justice | 386 |
| Dismissal from employment: The preliminary consideration | 391 |
| The limitation period to make representation | 392 |
| The claimant in his representation must pray for reinstatement | 397 |
| High Court decisions | 400 |
| Industrial Court awards | 401 |
| Death and survival of action | 416 |
| The common law approach..... | 418 |
| The statutory unfair dismissal approach | 418 |
| A review of <i>Hotel Istana v Nor Azam Baharin</i> | 424 |
| Claimant becomes an undischarged bankrupt | 432 |
| Process of adjudication of dismissal cases under section 20 of the IRA..... | 435 |
| Adjudication of Dismissal Cases under section 20 of the IRA: Its Procedures | 436 |
| The conciliation process in the IRD | 437 |
| Discretion of the Minister to refer dismissal cases to the Industrial Court | 441 |
| Industrial Court proceedings..... | 446 |
| Legalism in the Industrial Court | 448 |
| Early Evaluation of Cases | 452 |
| Practice Note on early evaluation of cases | 454 |
| Early Evaluation of Cases: The Process | 457 |
| Early Evaluation of Cases: Illustrations from Industrial Court Awards | 462 |
| Conclusion | 465 |

Chapter 12

The Requirements of Evidence to Establish A Dismissal

| | |
|--|-----|
| Introduction | 467 |
| Evidence Act 1950 in Industrial Court | 468 |
| Dismissal from employment: Burden of proof on employer | 472 |
| Circumstances where the claimant bears the burden of proof..... | 479 |
| Quantum of proof | 483 |
| Application of the Evidence Act 1950 in proceedings in the Industrial Court: The examples | 484 |
| Presumption under section 114(g) of the Evidence Act 1950 | 485 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| Circumstantial evidence | 488 |
| Confession | 489 |
| Affidavit evidence | 489 |
| Recalling witness | 491 |
| Judicial notice..... | 492 |
| Hearsay evidence | 493 |
| Expert evidence | 494 |
| Admission of documentary evidence..... | 495 |
| Corroboration | 496 |
| Res judicata..... | 498 |
| Others | 500 |
| Conclusion | 501 |

Chapter 13

Reinstatement in Dismissal Without Just Cause or Excuse

| | |
|---|-----|
| Introduction | 503 |
| Reinstatement: The primary remedy for dismissal without just cause or excuse | 505 |
| Reinstatement: Definition | 505 |
| Reinstatement includes re-engagement | 507 |
| The remedy of reinstatement: Within the discretion of the Industrial Court..... | 508 |
| The wishes of the claimant | 508 |
| Whether the award of reinstatement is expedient | 510 |
| The existence or otherwise of mutual trust and confidence | 511 |
| Harmonious relationship at the workplace cannot be restored | 514 |
| Examples of the circumstances where reinstatement awarded..... | 515 |
| An award of reinstatement: The events subsequent to its compliance | 517 |
| Reinstatement becoming a lost remedy | 518 |
| Delay of adjudication: Its effect on reinstatement | 520 |
| Interim reinstatement | 524 |
| Interim reinstatement: The practice in England..... | 525 |
| Interim reinstatement: The practice in New Zealand | 525 |
| <i>Dr David Vanniasingham Ramanathan's case: A Review</i> | 532 |
| Conclusion | 537 |

Chapter 14**Monetary Compensation for Dismissal Without Just Cause or Excuse**

| | |
|--|-----|
| Introduction | 539 |
| The types of monetary compensation | 543 |
| Compensation in lieu of reinstatement | 544 |
| Back wages | 547 |
| Dismissal of employee on probation | 566 |
| Recovering non-pecuniary losses | 568 |
| Loss of future earnings | 574 |
| Monetary compensation in favour of an undischarged bankrupt | 575 |

Chapter 15**Scaling Down Monetary Compensation: The Factors Considered**

| | |
|---|-----|
| Introduction | 577 |
| Claimant's duty to mitigate loss | 578 |
| Claimant caused or contributed to his own predicament.... | 586 |
| Maximum and Minimum Cap of Compensation..... | 589 |
| Interest on the monetary award..... | 590 |
| Cost of the proceedings | 591 |
| Proposed clauses on remedies for dismissal to be entrenched into the IRA | 591 |
| Remedies | 592 |
| Reinstatement to be primary remedy | 592 |
| Provisions applying if reinstatement ordered | 592 |
| The Industrial Court may order interim reinstatement | 593 |
| Reimbursement | 593 |
| Compensation | 594 |
| Remedy reduced if contributing behaviour of workman | 594 |
| Mitigation of loss | 595 |
| The limitation of monetary compensation | 595 |
| Power to award costs..... | 595 |
| Interest on the monetary award of the Industrial Court..... | 595 |

Chapter 16**Misconduct or Negligence of Employee and Losses to Employer: Recovering Losses Through Salary Deduction**

| | |
|--|-----|
| Introduction | 597 |
| Negligence in performance of duties or misconduct by employee: Recovery of damage or losses | 599 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| Salary deduction to reimburse employer for damage or losses suffered due to employee's wilful misconduct or negligence | 603 |
| Deduction of Salary | 603 |
| Salary deduction to reimburse employer for losses suffered due to employee's wilful misconduct or negligence | 605 |
| Conclusion | 607 |

Chapter 17

Award for Dismissal Without Just Cause or Excuse: The Enforcement

| | |
|--|-----|
| Introduction | 609 |
| Special circumstances to vary or set aside award | 610 |
| Non-compliance of award incurs criminal liability | 616 |
| Criminal liability of company director | 617 |
| Execution of the Award | 619 |
| Corporate employer becomes insolvent | 620 |
| Employer declared bankrupt or wound up after an award made | 621 |
| Inadequate protection of workers' statutory entitlements | 624 |
| Winding-up order of the corporate employer and its effect on contract of service | 626 |
| Distribution of the assets of the insolvent employer and the preferential payment | 629 |
| ILO Convention and Recommendation | 629 |
| Laws on the distribution of the insolvent employer's assets | 632 |
| Wage earner corporate insolvency fund | 636 |

Chapter 18

Judicial Review of Industrial Court's Award: The Process and Circumstances

| | |
|--|-----|
| Introduction | 639 |
| Contesting award of the Industrial Court | 641 |
| Judicial Review: A review of the decision making process | 644 |
| Development of judicial review since <i>South East Asia Fire Bricks</i> | 645 |
| Challenging the award of the Industrial Court | 651 |
| Reference of question of law to High Court | 653 |
| <i>Sabah Forest Industries v Industrial Court Malaysia & Richard Felin Jinivon: A review</i> | 658 |
| Prescribed law to challenge Industrial Court's award | 659 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| Section 33A was to ensure speedy resolution of disputes | 660 |
| IRA is a special law | 660 |
| High Court, the last stop | 660 |
| Judicial review made an unequal legal battle | 661 |
| Industrial Court made party to action | 662 |
| High Court decision in <i>UMW Toyota Motor Sdn Bhd v Chong Phui Lim @ Anthony Chong & Anor</i> | 664 |
| <i>Hwa Tai Industries Berhad v Mohd Fairuz Bala Bin Abdullah & Industrial Court Malaysia: A review</i> | 666 |
| <i>Sabah Forest Industries Sdn Bhd v Industrial Court Malaysia & Anor</i> | 669 |
| Stay of Execution of the Industrial Court's award | 674 |
| Judicial review of the awards of the Industrial Court: | |
| Its blemish..... | 678 |
| Not keeping in tandem with the spirit of the IRA..... | 679 |
| An unequal legal battle | 687 |
| The infusion of common law principles into industrial jurisprudence | 688 |
| Determining probationer's status in employment | 689 |
| The adoption of condonation in industrial jurisprudence | 691 |
| The use of contract test in constructive dismissal..... | 691 |
| Domestic Inquiry under section 14 of the Employment Act, 1955 | 692 |
| Rules on Pleading in Industrial Court | 693 |
| The industrial appeal process in England | 695 |
| The industrial appeal process in New Zealand | 696 |
| The mechanism of the Industrial Appeal Court | 698 |
| The proposed clauses for the establishment of IAC | 700 |
| Conclusion..... | 704 |

Chapter 19

Post-Dismissal Problems

| | |
|--|-----------------------------|
| Introduction | Restraint of trade clauses: |
| The enforceability | 708 |
| Disclosure of confidential information | 712 |

Chapter 20

Employer's Guidelines in Minimising Risk of Litigation And Employee's Guidelines to Successfully Pleading Constructive Dismissal

| | |
|---|-----|
| Introduction | 727 |
| Analysis of Non-Dismissal Awards from 2005 to 2012..... | 729 |

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|---|-----|
| Analysis of Non-Dismissal Awards from 2005 to 2012..... | 729 |
| Employer's Guidelines in an Impending Dismissal | 731 |
| Procedural fairness..... | 747 |
| Evidence..... | 750 |
| Employee's Guidelines in Successfully Pleading | |
| Constructive Dismissal..... | 757 |
| Burden of proof in constructive dismissal | 766 |
| Chapter 21 | |
| Employment Obligations: The Islamic Perspective | |
| Introduction | 769 |
| Seeking employment: The Islamic approach..... | 770 |
| The Employer/Employee Relationship | 772 |
| Employees' obligation to discharge <i>amanat</i> or trust | 774 |
| Discharging duties conscientiously: The employees' | |
| responsibilities | 777 |
| Failure to discharge responsibilities conscientiously | 778 |
| Protection of human dignity | 782 |
| Prevention of Sexual Harassment: The Islamic Approach | 785 |
| Drug abuse in the workplace and rights of the employer | 787 |
| Transforming the Islamic injunction into law..... | 788 |
| Accountability in the hereafter..... | 789 |
| Index..... | 793 |